



## **Paper for Discussion: “Good Night” Milks**

### **Agenda Item: 3**

Please see paper attached.

## **Good Night Milks**

### **Issue**

1. To consider the place of “Good Night” milk products for infants 6 months of age and above.

### **Background**

2. Infant formula manufacturers Cow & Gate and HiPP Organic have recently introduced “Good night” milk drinks marketed to help with settling babies at bedtime. HiPP Organic’s Good Night Milk Drink is described on the package as a “milk based meal of organic Follow-on milk with added organic cereals”, whereas Cow & Gate’s Good Night Milk is marketed as a “thicker specially formulated follow-on formula”. Both are intended for use as a night-time liquid feed in a bottle or a feeding cup. They differ from infant formula and follow-on formula in that they have added starch, which makes the drink more viscous.

### *Composition*

3. “Good Night” milks are similar in nutritional composition to follow-on milks, but intended for use just at bedtime for infants over 6 months. Both products broadly comply with the essential composition requirements for follow-on formula (as specified by Commission Directive 2006/141/EC). HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink has a higher energy density (76 kcal per 100ml) and slightly lower vitamin C content (2.13mg per 100 kJ) than that specified by the Infant Formula and Follow on Formula Regulations, and Cow & Gate Good Night Milk has a slightly lower thiamin content (13.6µg per 100 kJ). Annex 1 compares the composition with that of Follow-on formula, and for processed cereal-based weaning foods (as specified by Commission Directive 2006/125/EC). The Follow-on Formula Regulations do not specify an amount for added starch but starch is not prohibited.
4. Both products are of increased viscosity, higher in carbohydrate and have cereal added i.e. organic corn starch, organic pregelatinised rice flour and organic whole-grain oatmeal (HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink) and rice flakes, potato starch (Cow & Gate Good Night Milk). Cow & Gate’s Good Night Milk also contains galacto-oligosaccharides. For a full list of ingredients, see Annex 2.
5. HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink contains 3.1g of starch per 100ml drink. The starch content for the Cow & Gate product is not stated, but by inference, there is approximately 2g of starch per 100ml of made up product.
6. When used as a bedtime feed, a night-time feed of approximately 250ml (made up), as guided by HiPP in their instructions (infants from 12 months = 210ml water + 37.1g powder), would provide approximately 7.75g starch, amounting to 29 kcal of metabolisable energy. For Cow & Gate’s Good Night Milk, a night-time feed of approximately 240ml (made up), as guided in their instructions (210ml water + 35.7g powder), would provide 4.8g starch, amounting to 18 kcal metabolisable energy.

## Claims

7. The companies make several claims about these products. The following claims are made on the product packaging, and/or on the website (see Annex 3):

*“Help settle your baby at bedtime”* (Cow & Gate)

*“...to help soothe and settle babies at the end of the day, in readiness of a good night’s sleep...”* (HiPP Organic)

8. The companies also claim the following:

*“It is also gentler and easier for tiny tummies to digest than cow’s milk!”* (HiPP Organic)

*“...thicker than regular follow-on milk and gentle on your baby’s tummy”* (Cow & Gate)

## Discussion

9. It is unclear whether these products are follow-on milks or should be considered as complementary foods. Both products comply with the composition requirements for follow-on formula. HiPP market their product as a “*milk based meal of organic Follow-on milk with added organic cereals*” but as it is in a liquid form, advise it to be given in a bottle or a feeding cup. Department of Health advice to mothers is that “if you are bottle feeding, don’t add any foods (including rusks, cereal or sugar) to the milk”<sup>1</sup>. In addition, bottle-fed complementary foods are classified as breast-milk substitutes<sup>2</sup>.
10. The German Society of Paediatrics considered products similar to those marketed as bottle-feeds in the UK, that are not formula but complementary foods. These had energy densities of 85-110 kcal/100ml and apparently contained gluten cereals. The Society brought out a statement in 2007 against the Marketing of Complementary Feeds for Bottle Feeding and concluded that this practice endangers child health. They considered these products as bottle-fed complementary foods and advised paediatricians to warn families against using them. They also requested manufacturers to withdraw these products from the market. However, “Good Night” milks in the UK contain lower energy density and Cow and Gate’s Good Night Milk is labelled gluten-free. Gluten is not listed in the ingredients of the HiPP Organic product, but on the packaging, it states, “contains gluten”.
11. One other concern raised by the Society was that marketing bottle-feeds rich in carbohydrates as “good night feeds” may lead parents to bring babies to bed with their bottle; this could possibly result in prolonged exposure to bottle feeds rich in carbohydrates that may induce nursing bottle caries. This remains a concern, although both products do advise cleaning the baby’s teeth after the last feed at night.

---

<sup>1</sup> Department of Health (2008) Weaning: Starting on solid food [www.dh.gov.uk](http://www.dh.gov.uk)

<sup>2</sup> WHO (2008) The International Code of Marketing of Breast-milk Substitutes: Frequently asked questions. Updated version 2008.

12. We have not been able to identify any scientific evidence to support the claims made with respect to settling the baby for the night, or being gentler on the baby's tummy (search terms: starch, carbohydrate, cereal, settling, night-time feed, sleep, bed-time meal).
13. New European Regulation (EC) No 1924/2006, which applied across the UK from 1 July 2007, controls the use of nutrition and health claims by prior authorisation and listing of claims. Health claims must be substantiated by generally accepted scientific evidence (with some allowance for emerging science) and the Nutrition Panel of the European Food Safety Authority (EFSA) is responsible for assessing if the substantiating science is sufficient. The European Commission and Member States will use EFSA's opinion to inform their decision on whether a particular claim should be authorised for use. The list of permitted health claims is currently being compiled. Transitional period applies pending EFSA's assessment of the scientific dossiers and the final decision by the Commission and Member States.
14. The Infant Feeding Survey 2005<sup>3</sup> showed that 25% of mothers were breastfeeding at 6 months. These milks are likely to replace breast-milk as night-time feeds and potentially could undermine breastfeeding. Cow & Gate's product displays the "important notice" on breastfeeding, which is required on infant formula and follow-on formula products, but HiPP Organic's product does not. Since bottle-fed complementary foods are classified as breast-milk substitutes<sup>2</sup>, the labelling and promotion of these products is important.
15. The Committee are asked to consider the following questions:
- 1) What is the place of these products in the diet of infants 6 months and over?**
  - 2) Are there risks or benefits associated with the use of these products?**
  - 3) Are members aware of evidence to substantiate scientifically the claims stated in paragraphs 7 and 8?**

---

<sup>3</sup> Bolling K, Grant C, Hamlyn B, Thornton A. (2007) Infant Feeding Survey 2005. The Information Centre

## **Annex 1 - Nutritional Information**

Values below are given per 100 kJ for each product, and compared to the essential composition for follow-on formula\* (Directive 2006/141/EC) and weaning foods\*\* (Directive 2006/125/EC).

Value	Essential composition of Follow-on Formula* (per 100kJ)		HiPP Organic 'Good Night Milk Drink' (per 100kJ)	Cow & Gate 'Good Night Milk' (per 100kJ)	Essential composition of processed cereal-based foods** [see note below] (per 100kJ)
	Min	Max			
Energy (per 100ml)	250 kJ 60 kcal	295 kJ 70 kcal	320 kJ 76 kcal	295 kJ 70 kcal	
Protein	0.45 g	0.8 g	0.63 g	0.61 g	Protein content: max 1.3g Added protein: min 0.48g
Total Carbohydrate of which:	2.2 g	3.4 g	2.97 g	3.05 g	If sucrose, fructose, glucose syrups or honey are added the max amount of added CHO from these sources: 1.2g Added fructose: max 0.6g
sugars (lactose)	1.1 g	-	1.94 g	2.37 g	
Total Fat	0.96 g	1.4 g	1.03 g	1.02 g	Max fat content: 1.1g
Of which: saturates	-	-	0.31 g	0.44 g	
Fibre	-	-	0.06 g	0.27 g	
Sodium	5 mg	14 mg	6.25 mg	6.78 mg	Max: 25mg
Vitamin A	14 µg (RE)	43 µg (RE)	22.5 µg (RE)	20.0 µg (RE)	14 – 43 µg (RE)
Vitamin D	0.25 µg	0.75 µg	0.31 µg	0.47 µg	0.25 – 0.75 µg
Vitamin E	0.1 mg	-	0.22 mg	0.26 mg	Max: 0.73mg
Vitamin C	2.5 mg	7.5 mg	2.13 mg	2.71 mg	Max: 6.09mg
Thiamin (vit B1)	14 µg	72 µg	31.3 µg	13.6 µg	Min: 25 µg
Calcium	12 mg	33 mg	25.3 mg	25.8 mg	Min: 20mg
Phosphorus	6 mg	22 mg	21.9 mg	15.6 mg	-

Value	Essential composition of Follow-on Formula* (per 100kJ)		HiPP Organic 'Good Night Milk Drink' (per 100kJ)	Cow & Gate 'Good Night Milk' (per 100kJ)	Essential composition of processed cereal-based foods** [see note below] (per 100kJ)
	Min	Max			
Iron	0.14 mg	0.5 mg	0.34 mg	0.37 mg	Max: 0.73mg
Zinc	0.12 mg	0.36 mg	0.16 mg	0.24 mg	Max: 0.49mg
Iodine	2.5 µg	12 µg	3.44 µg	3.73 µg	Max: 8.5 µg
Potassium	15 mg	38 mg	24.1 mg	27.5 mg	Max: 39 mg (applies to product as sold)

\* Commission Directive 2006/141/EC on Infant Formula and Follow-on Formula

\*\* Commission Directive 2006/125/EC on processed cereal-based foods and baby foods for infants and young children

**Note:** Compositional requirements given are for that category of processed cereal-based foods referred to in Article 1(2)(a)(ii) of Directive 2006/125/EC as “cereals with an added high protein food which are or have to be reconstituted with water or other protein free liquid”.

Note also that Annex 1 to Directive 2006/125/EC requires that, for processed cereal based foods, the amount of cereal and/or starchy root shall not be less than 25% of the final mixture on a dry weight for weight basis.

Figures provided per 100kJ. This relates to product ready for use, marketed as such or reconstituted as instructed by the manufacturer.

## Annex 2 – Product Ingredients

The ingredients lists for both products are given below:

### a) HiPP Organic ‘Good Night Milk Drink’

**Ingredients:** Organic Follow-on milk (75%) [organic skimmed milk powder, organic lactose, organic vegetable oils (palm, rapeseed, sunflower), organic corn starch, calcium phosphate, calcium carbonate, vitamin mix (vitamin C, vitamin E, vitamin A, vitamin D), iron diphosphate, zinc oxide, potassium iodate], organic pregelatinised rice flour (13%), organic whole-grain oatmeal (13%), emulsifier (soya lecithin), thiamin (vitamin B1 )



### b) Cow & Gate ‘Good Night Milk’

**Ingredients:** Lactose\*, Skimmed Milk\*, Vegetable Oils, Prebiotic Fibres (Galacto-Oligosaccharides\*, Polyfructose), Rice Flakes, Potato Starch, Calcium Carbonate, Vitamin C, Magnesium Citrate, Emulsifier (Soya Lecithin), Taurine, Choline Chloride, Iron Sulphate, Zinc Sulphate, Cytidine 5'-Monophosphate, Adenosine 5'-Monophosphate, Uridine 5'-Monophosphate, Inosine 5'-Monophosphate, Vitamin E, Niacin, Guanosine 5'-Monophosphate, Folic Acid, Copper Sulphate, Pantothenic Acid, Vitamin A, Vitamin D, Beta-Carotene, Biotin, Vitamin B12, Vitamin B6, Thiamin, Manganese Sulphate, Potassium Iodide, Vitamin K, Sodium Selenite, Contains: \*Milk, Soya



## **Annex 3 – Company’s Web Content** (as correct on 26.08.08 at 2pm)

### **1) HiPP Organic Goodnight Milk:**

#### **Good Night Milk Drink**

The special blend of organic Follow-on milk with organic cereals makes HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink satisfyingly creamy.

This bedtime meal can be prepared in either a bottle or a beaker\*

[Click here](#) for frequently asked questions about HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink



Warm milky drinks are known for being soothing and settling at bedtime making HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink the perfect end to your little one’s busy day.

This unique milk drink is suitable from 6 months to 3 years of age as an alternative to the evening Follow-on milk feed or meal.

Organic cereals, rice and oats, are very easy for your baby to digest and are often used in weaning foods, making this milk drink ideal from 6 months onwards.

The organic Follow-on Milk is a great source of calcium and has been enriched with iron, vitamins and minerals for healthy development. It is also gentler and easier for tiny tummies to digest than cow’s milk!

**NOW available direct from the HiPP Shop with free delivery!**

\* We recommend that beakers are introduced in to your baby’s feeding routine as early as possible to prevent prolonged contact of your baby’s teeth with milk feeds which may increase the risk of tooth decay.

To find out more about our Good Night Milk Drink, [click here](#)



#### **Your feedback**

"Hi, Just wanted to say how Fab the Good Night Milk Drink is.... I give this to my 8 month old son Leo at bedtime, and as soon as he has finished his bottle, he is sound asleep till the morning, very content!"

Angela, Stockport

### Your feedback

"I would just like to say how wonderful your jars of baby food are in taste and texture. My son is 6 and a half months old now and enjoys a bottle of your good night milk drink before bed which enables him to sleep all night long"

Julie, from Skegness

### FREE CHART

Download our handy sleep chart here!



[A simple and easy way to monitor your baby's sleep patterns](#)

The HiPP Sleep FAQ



Visit our FAQ section about 'sleeping', with useful hints and tips about settling your baby' [click here to find out more](#)

### Frequently asked questions about HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink

- ♥ [How can this product contain cereals and still be given in a bottle?](#)
- ♥ [Is this a follow-on milk formula?](#)
- ♥ [How often can I use HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink?](#)
- ♥ [Will this product interfere with a well balanced diet?](#)
- ♥ [The product appears to be prepared like a follow-on milk is this true?](#)
- ♥ [Why is HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink only suitable from 6 months?](#)
- ♥ [Is HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink a drink or a weaning food?](#)
- ♥ [Why is this made with follow-on milk and not cow's milk if it is a weaning food?](#)
- ♥ [Is this product easy for my little one to digest?](#)
- ♥ [Does HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink contain more calories than follow-on milk?](#)
- ♥ [Does my baby need to go straight to sleep after drinking this?](#)

---

**My follow-on milk packaging states that I should not add cereals to feeds given in a bottle. I'm confused and concerned as this product contains cereals and can be given in a bottle?**

This product has a carefully controlled formulation, both nutritionally and in terms of its cereal to liquid ratio, so that it is perfectly safe to be given from a bottle if required. As HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink is suitable from 6 months to 3 years of age, it is possible that at 6 months a baby will still be being fed from a

bottle; however we support and encourage the introduction of a beaker or feeder cup as soon as possible.

[FAQ](#)

---

#### Is this a follow-on milk formula?

This product is **not** a follow-on formula but a milk based bedtime meal made from Organic Follow-on milk and organic cereals. It **should not** replace other milk feeds throughout the day.

[FAQ](#)

---

#### How often can I use HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink?

This cereal based baby food is designed to be given **ONCE** per day in place of an evening follow-on milk feed or meal. The important feeding information on the tin states: "This meal is designed to be given once per day and should not be used more frequently."

[FAQ](#)

---

#### If this product is being used in place of the evening follow-on milk feed or meal won't this interfere with my baby getting a well balanced diet?

HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink will not prevent your baby from getting a well balanced diet, as it is intended to replace either follow-on milk or a light meal in the evening only. Therefore other meals and drinks will be being taken through the day, and these should be made up of a variety of different foods that can provide your baby with a wide range of nutrients. HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink used once per day can make a valuable contribution to a baby's intake of calcium and iron for healthy development.

[FAQ](#)

---

#### The product looks as if it should be prepared like a follow-on formula, is this true?

The preparation instructions do have some similarity to those stated on follow-on milks however as the Good Night Milk Drink has a thicker texture there are some differences to the way in which it is prepared. The product should be made with cooled boiling water (left for approx.30 minutes) like a follow-on formula. Rather than measuring all the water into sterilised bottle or beaker to begin with, you need to measure this into a jug and then measure 2/3rd of the water into a sterilised bottle or beaker and add the required amount of powder, cap the bottle/put on the lid and shake vigorously. Uncap the bottle or beaker and add the remaining water, recap/reid, shake to mix, replace cap with a sterilised large hole/fast flow teat. Always check the temperature before giving this to your baby.

[FAQ](#)

---

**Why is HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink only suitable from 6 months onwards?**

HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink is blended using organic Follow-on milk and Organic cereals. It contains gluten, which is not recommended for babies under 6 months.

The Department of Health recommends exclusive breastfeeding for the first 6 months of life. The decision to begin weaning (including the introduction of a follow-on milk formula before 6 months of age) should only be made on the advice of a doctor, health visitor, public health nurse, dietician or pharmacist, based upon the individual infants specific growth and development needs.

[FAQ](#)

---

**Is HiPP Organic Good Night Drink a drink or a weaning food?**

HiPP Organic Good Night milk drink meets the nutritional and legal criteria for cereal based weaning foods. It is made with 25% cereals and 75% Follow-on milk, and therefore it is a weaning food.

As the product is designed to help soothe and settle babies at the end of the day, in readiness of a good night's sleep, it has been formulated as a warm 'drink' which is customary at this time of day, rather than a meal to be given from a bowl.

The decision to begin weaning (including the introduction of a follow-on milk formula before 6 months of age) should only be made on the advice of a doctor, health visitor, public health nurse, dietitian or pharmacist, based upon the individual infant's specific growth and development needs.

[FAQ](#)

---

**The product is made with 75% follow-on milk; if it is a weaning food why isn't it made with cow's milk?**

As cow's milk is not recommended as the main milk drink for babies under 1 year, and as HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink can be given from 6 months onwards the product has been formulated with Follow-on milk. Follow-on milk is particularly suitable as it is designed for this age group and has the desired protein, mineral, vitamin and iron levels.

[FAQ](#)

---

**I'm concerned that this product will be difficult for my little one to digest and that it may keep them awake at night as a result.**

The cereals used in HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink are often used in weaning foods as they are easy for tiny tummies to digest. HiPP Organic Follow-on milk is designed to be given to babies of 6 months onwards and therefore has been formulated to be suitable for babies of this age to digest. The mixture of these cereals and Follow-on milk has been found to be well digested by babies.

[FAQ](#)

---

**If this product contains cereals, won't it contain more calories, than Follow-on milk?**

HiPP Organic Follow-on milk contains 69 calories per 100ml and HiPP Organic Good Night Milk contains 76 calories per 100ml, and so this does have a slightly higher calorific value. However as this is designed to be given once per day, in place of the evening follow-on milk feed or a meal, this should not have a significant impact overall. Growing-up formulas suitable from 10 months typically contain 79 calories per 100ml.

[FAQ](#)

---

**Will my baby go to sleep straight after drinking HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink?**

HiPP Organic Good Night Milk Drink can be an important part of the bedtime routine, and settling your baby for the night. However you should make sure that you clean your baby's teeth and then undertake all the normal activities such as reading a bedtime story and having cuddle time, before they drift off to sleep.

[FAQ](#)

## **2) Cow & Gate Goodnight Milk:**

[Home](#) > [What's New](#) > Help settle your baby at bedtime

## **Help settle your baby at bedtime**

New **Cow & Gate Good Night Follow-on Milk** has been specially developed to help settle your baby ready for bed when used as part of their bedtime routine.

A nutritionally tailored milk for bottle fed babies, Cow & Gate Good Night Milk is thicker than regular follow-on milk, but gentle on your baby's tummy, and provides a warm, contented and satisfying end to the day.

Ideally serve warm after bath time instead of your usual baby milk from 6 months.

### **Creating a bedtime routine for your baby**



As a mum you know how important it is to establish a consistent and predictable bedtime routine to help relax your baby at bedtime, so they're more likely to wind down and settle.

Like all of us though, babies take time to get used to a new routine, but keep going and soon they will expect it and feel secure with it.

Here are some ideas to help you enjoy the special time together as you get your baby ready for bed:

- First, relax them with a warm, calming bath.
- Turn down the bedroom lights to create a cosy, soothing atmosphere.
- Give your baby some warm Cow & Gate Good Night Milk for a satisfying end to the day.
- Gently sing a lullaby or read a bedtime story in a soft, soothing voice, to help relax your baby.
- Kiss your baby goodnight – your touch and smell will help them feel safe and secure.

New Cow & Gate Good Night Follow-on Milk will be available from all major retailers in selected stores from the following dates:

- Asda 14 January
- Sainsbury's 27 January
- Morrisons 4 February
- Tesco 18 February
- Boots 7 March (also available now online at Boots.com)



Make it part of your baby's bedtime routine, to help them feel relaxed, happy and contented at bedtime.

This document had been prepared for consideration by the Scientific Advisory Committee on Nutrition. It does not necessarily represent the final views of the Group or the policy of Health Departments and the Food Standards Agency.

## Give us your baby bedtime tips

We're asking real mums to give us their best pieces of bedtime advice to be featured in a new book of Baby Bedtime Tips. Is there a tried and trusted method that has been passed down through generations of your family? Or perhaps you have a unique twist you add to the normal routine?

Whatever you do, we want to share your tips with other mums in this one-off book which will feature your name, your tip and a photo of you and your baby. Email us at [cowandgate@bravepr.com](mailto:cowandgate@bravepr.com) and tell us your best baby bedtime tip, along with your name and your baby's age, and if your tip is chosen we'll be in touch! Alternatively, you can post your tip on our special [bedtime tips](#) forum.

If you'd like any more support in helping your baby to settle, or would like more information about Cow & Gate follow-on milks, contact one of our baby feeding advisors.

Carole, baby care advisor and mum

[Call us](#) [email us](#) [Live chat](#)

08457 623 623

[Back to previous page](#) [Back to top](#)