

**RESPONSES AND COMMENTS ON DRAFT REPORT TFA REPORT – NOVEMBER 07**

Member	Comments	Action
<b>Conclusions and Recommendations</b>		
A Williams	<p>Para 205: <b>“1% decrease in energy from <i>trans</i> FA”</b>. A decrease of 1% from what level? You need to cite this or current paragraph sits uneasily with the preceding one (specifically point ii). For example I assume that a decrease from 2% to 1% wouldn't have this effect.</p> <p>Para 206: <b>“would require an average reduction”</b>: Do you mean a reduction of 0.6% in the population average consumption, rather than “<i>..an average reduction in intake of 0.6%</i>” which seems something a bit different? The latter presumably would do very little for individuals at the top end.</p> <p><b>“this decrease”</b>: Again, with reference to paragraph 204, I'm not clear that the range of intakes on which the meta-analysis risk estimate is based is applicable to a reduction in population average consumption from 1.2% to 0.6%</p> <p>Para 208: This paragraph should come higher up, and shouldn't you be much stronger than “<i>may be</i>”. Paragraph 204 says we haven't got the evidence, but what we do have doesn't seem to indicate much effect.</p> <p>Para 215: <b>“may be associated to moderate loss of fat mass”</b>: Personally I still think this is too strong. The implication of “moderate loss of fat” to some (especially the internet supplement vendors) could be that CLA is an effective treatment in obesity. The effect size quoted in paragraph 200 was 24g fat lost per g of CLA ingested per week (p only 0.03), which amounts to something like 1-1/4 lb of fat lost over 6-months – and beyond that there appears to be decreasing effect. Surely that is better described as small and of unclear clinical significance than “<i>moderate</i>”?</p> <p>Para 223: <b>“However, further reductions in <i>trans</i> FA may have adverse consequences for attempts to reduce SFA intakes to &lt; 11% energy”</b>: This may be true, but is it explained in the report? If not am unclear why it is a “Conclusion”.  <i>“Unintended consequences”</i> sounds a bit cryptic to me</p>	<p>Agree with comment and have clarified by adding additional sentence to paragraph 208.</p> <p>Agree and have changed wording.</p> <p>Can appreciate the point being made, but the new sentence added to above paragraph, combined with statement in Para 208, do indicate the limitations of the extrapolated.</p> <p>As have now reworded, we feel its sits best after the estimates rather than before  ‘Maybe’ replaced by ‘is likely to be’.</p> <p>Paragraph has been removed, as not relevant to the terms of reference. Have kept in main text as relevant to subject.</p> <p>Agree, sentence now deleted</p> <p>Wording changed</p>
P Aggett	<p>Para 215: I share the team's concerns about the relevance of CLA in this re port and their lack of time to do its review justice: CLA seems a little incongruous here anyway. Drop: no strong feelings I appreciate that there might be other drivers.</p> <p>Para 222: <b>“agreed that there is currently no firm scientific basis for the recommendations”</b> change to “agreed that there is currently no firm scientific basis for the revising the recommendations”</p> <p>Para's 224, 225, 227 &amp; 228: These are more like summaries; could they be refashioned to be research recommendations?</p> <p>Para 229: Not really a recommendation.</p>	<p>Paragraph has been removed, as not relevant to the terms of reference. Have kept in main text as relevant to subject.</p> <p>Agree and have changed wording.</p> <p>The authors were requested to include a recommendation for each of the terms of reference and so this section is structured accordingly.</p> <p>The two parts of this paragraph need to be kept together as the first part justifies the second part, particularly with respect to the range of FA intakes relevant to the UK</p>
S Walsh	<p>I am not sure if it would be relevant to have a recommendation related to industry practice.</p> <p>There is a comment in the text that levels of trans fats are on the decline because of changes in manufacturing processes.</p>	

