

Dear Sir/Madam

With my Nutrition Society Honorary Communications Officer and National Osteoporosis Society SAG Membership 'hats-on', I have now thoroughly read the 50 page document (31 pages of key text without Reference and Annexes). May I congratulate the authors - it is an excellent report: clear, concise and well referenced with the key papers.

My specific comments are as follows:

Point 4: It would be useful to qualify the term 'some' re individuals being above 1500ug RE of vitamin A. This point is also relevant to the Conclusions section.

Point 30: Mention of osteocytes re skeletal turnover.

Point 31: Change the order of nutrients listed re importance to bone health, bringing vitamin D higher up the list; quantify further the protein effect; include potassium in the list; consider a mention regarding sodium.

Point 32: Might be helpful into include quantification here - eg 1SD change in BMD will result in a 50% reduction in fracture risk.

Point 40-78: Human Studies. These are detailed in exemplary fashion but all the studies listed are either from the USA (majority), Sweden or Iceland. The study by the Sheffield group, funded by the FSA has been presented in abstract form at the September 2004 ASBMR conference and so I wonder if it would be useful to include here.

Points 163: I do think that cod liver oil use needs to be emphasized.

Conclusions and recommendations: I think it would be helpful to have more forceful comment regarding cod liver oil use, given that the high strength cod liver oil does really contain appreciable amounts of retinol and older women could easily be in a situation of over-dosing.

With my best wishes

Sue

Susan A New BA MSc PhD RPHNutr
Reader in Nutrition
Centre for Nutrition & Food Safety
School of Biomedical & Molecular Sciences
University of Surrey
Guildford. GU2 7XH.
United Kingdom

Tel No. +44 (0) 1483 686476

Fax No. +44 (0) 1483 576978